

Secure Shell (SSH): Public Key Authentication over Hypertext Transfer Protocol (HTTP)

Dorai Ashok S.A. <dash.r@mpipe.net>

0th Root Software Research Private Limited

No.87A, Vembuliamman Koil Street, Periya Nolambur, Chennai-600095, India

Phone: +91 44 2653 2984

June 17, 2015

Abstract

The Secure Shell (SSH) protocol requires all implementations to support public key authentication method (“publickey”) for authentication purposes [2]. Hypertext Transfer Protocol (HTTP) applications which provide a SSH client over the web browser need to support “publickey”. However, restrictions in HTTP, such as Same Origin Policy, make it difficult to perform such authentications. In this document, a system to perform “publickey” authentication over HTTP is provided. It is ensured that no compromise is made that would pose a security risk to SSH protocol.

low, to be signed by the private key of the user. And, the signed message should be verified by the server using the public key added by the user. On successful verification, authentication is successful and the user is permitted to login.

string	session identifier
byte	SSH_MSG_USERAUTH_REQUEST
string	user name
string	service name
string	"publickey"
boolean	TRUE
string	public key algorithm name
string	public key blob

1 Introduction

The Secure Shell (SSH) protocol is a protocol for secure remote login to servers. It computes a shared key through key exchange mechanisms, such as Diffie-Hellman key exchange [3], and establishes a secure channel for communication to servers. Users are authenticated through the secure channel using one of the accepted authentication methods. Commonly used authentication methods include “password” and “publickey”. As the name suggests, in case of “password” method, the user is simply required to provide his/her *password* for authentication. However, “publickey” method uses public/private key pairs for authentication.

The Hypertext Transfer Protocol (HTTP) is an application-level protocol for data transfer across the internet. It is generic, stateless and can be used for purposes beyond hypertext.

2 Authentication “publickey”

In “publickey” authentication method, User creates a public/private key pair and adds the public key on the server. For successful authentication, the SSH protocol requires the *message* [2], shown be-

The *session identifier*, shown above, is a *secret* and is specific to that SSH session.

It is common for private keys to be kept in an encrypted format for security reasons. However, this creates the hassle of decrypting the private key for authentication every single time. Authentication agents, such as *ssh-agent* [4], handle this by managing the decrypted private keys and signing messages for SSH clients on demand.

3 Authentication agents

ssh-agent implements OpenSSH agent protocol [4] to manage private keys and to *sign* messages. Clients connect to the agent, typically, over an UNIX domain socket to send requests and receive responses. UNIX domain socket is a special file in the file system. To restrict access, the special file has read/write permissions only for the user.

If we could implement an authentication agent, similar to *ssh-agent*, that would manage private keys but accept signing requests over HTTP. That would be an agent which can enable SSH “publickey” authentications through HTTP clients.

4 SSH Web Agent

Here, we are defining a new authentication agent, *ssh-webagent*, which responds to authentication requests over HTTP. It accepts requests only from user and only on *localhost*. And, due to same origin policy, HTTP clients will not accept content from *localhost* unless Cross Origin Resource Sharing (CORS) [5] is enabled. It is also recommended that *ssh-webagent* accept HTTP requests over TLS [7] to avoid Mixed Content [6].

4.1 Trusted Servers

On receiving an authentication request, it is important to identify the source of the request. A HTTP client could connect to *ssh-webagent* out of any web page, and without verification, a serious security risk exists. To verify the source, a combination of HTTP *Referer* header and public key of the server should be used. While the *Referer* header can be used to identify the public key of the server, the actual verification is successful only if the signature provided by the server is valid.

Server's public key and HTTP Referer changes for each web application. It is therefore recommended that a *trusted servers* file is used to hold the public key of trusted servers along with the expected values of HTTP Referer header. The *trusted servers* file should be kept safe to avoid unauthorized modifications. A sample format for *trusted servers* file has been provided in Appendix A.

4.2 Identifiers

HTTP is stateless and each request is independent of the other. Each HTTP request has a corresponding response but the order of HTTP requests and state, if any, shall be managed by the application.

In case of authentication over a TCP connection, a session is established and can be uniquely identified by 5-tuple¹. However, HTTP provides no session and hence *ssh-webagent* has to establish a logical session to the trusted server and assign a unique *identifier*. *ssh-webagent* can interact with multiple trusted servers at the same time. And, *ssh-webagent* shall choose the unique *identifier*.

The state of the authentication process shall be maintained in association with the *identifier*. However, it should be noted that, a failure in the authentication process may not always be known to *ssh-webagent*. So, it is essential to maintain a reasonably short timeout for the authentication process, beyond which the *identifier* and its associated state is destroyed.

¹source IP address, source port, destination IP address, destination port, transport protocol

4.3 Local User and Local Host

Since *ssh-webagent* accepts authentication request on *localhost*, it shall be ensured that the request is from the same user who runs *ssh-webagent*. Support for this feature varies across operating systems and Appendix C shows how the owner of a TCP connection can be identified on systems running Linux kernel.

When *ssh-webagent* binds to a specific port on *localhost*, no other user will be able to use the same port. So, applications which intend to support multiple local users, can choose multiple ports and send authentication request to all of them. A standard has been proposed to use a specific local IP address and port for *ssh-webagent* in Appendix B.

4.4 Session

ssh-webagent shall establish a secure session with the trusted server before processing authentication requests. The session is initiated by a signed request from the trusted server with Diffie-Hellman (DH)² parameters. On successful verification, *ssh-webagent* shall send a Diffie-Hellman response with an encrypted *identifier*. The secret established through Diffie-Hellman key exchange shall be used in the encryption of the *identifier*. And, once the trusted server successfully decrypts this *identifier*, the session is established.

The authentication process following session creation, will use the *identifier* in both clear and encrypted data. *ssh-webagent* shall identify the session using the clear text *identifier*. However, it shall verify that the *identifier* in encrypted data matches the one in clear text.

5 Proposed Protocol

In this section, we define a protocol over HTTP that can be used for “publickey” authentication. It involves both session creation and authentication process. We start with the format of HTTP requests and responses before discussing each of them in detail.

5.1 HTTP Request/Response

The protocol uses base64 encoded *messages* in both HTTP request and response. HTTP request shall use *method* POST and content type *application/x-www-form-urlencoded*, while HTTP response shall use content type *text/plain*. HTTP request in this format will classify as simple cross-site request under CORS specification [5].

²Diffie-Hellman Key Exchange algorithm[3]

P=[Message]&U=[User]&S=[Service]

As a POST request, the key **P** shall be used to pass messages and, optionally, the keys **U** and **S** shall be used to pass user and service names³ respectively.

[Message]

The response body simply contains the message in response to the request and nothing more.

5.2 Message

Message is the basic unit of the protocol. A single *message* is received in the HTTP request and a single *message* is sent in the HTTP response. Message uses a binary format and data types used, in representation of the format, are as defined in RFC 4251 [1], Section 5 “Data Type Representations Used in the SSH Protocols”.

string	“SSHWebAgent”
byte	version
byte	type
string	data

version shall indicate the version of the protocol and shall be used to check compatability of *ssh-webagent* and *trusted server*.

VERSION_1_1	0x11
-------------	------

type shall indicate the type of data the message holds.

KEX_DH_REQUEST	0x02
KEX_DH_RESPONSE	0x03
PRIVATE	0x04

data holds request parameters and response values in binary format. The format varies based on *type* and, hence, are described in their respective sections.

5.3 Session

Session is initiated by a message from *trusted server* containing key exchange parameters and its signature. The message will contain *data* of type KEX_DH_REQUEST in the format described below,

mpint	p
mpint	g
mpint	e
string	d
string	k
string	sign

p, g are Diffie-Hellman key exchange parameters prime number and generator, respectively.

³user and service names are part of SSH message, See Section 2

e is the computed value of *trusted server* in key exchange

d is session data, if any, added by *trusted server*. It shall be used by *ssh-webagent* without any interpretation.

k, sign are the public key and signature, of the *trusted server*, represented in their respective formats as defined in RFC 4253 [3], Section 6.6 “Public Key Algorithms”.

5.3.1 Verification

On receiving the message, *ssh-webagent* uses the trusted servers file and checks if the public key and the HTTP Referer are trusted. On a successful match, the message shall be checked for authenticity through signature verification. The following values are used in the specified order for signing and verification,

mpint	p
mpint	g
mpint	e
string	method
string	referer
string	k
string	d

method shall be the *method* used in HTTP request. As mentioned in Section 5.1, this shall be POST.

referer shall be the value of Referer field in HTTP request header.

5.3.2 Response

On successful verification of signature, *ssh-webagent* shall send a message containing *data* of type KEX_DH_RESPONSE in the format described below,

mpint	f
string	E

f is the computed value of *ssh-webagent* in key exchange.

E is the encrypted *message body* of type NEW viewable only by *trusted server*. *message body* is described, in detail, in Section 5.4.

5.3.3 Secret

The secret **S** is computed by *ssh-webagent* through Diffie-Hellman key exchange and it is used to compute a *shared secret*, a *secret key* and an *initialization vector*.

1. Shared Secret

shared secret is the computed hash of the following values using 256-bit Secure Hash Algorithm (SHA-256) [8].

string	method
string	referer
mpint	e
mpint	f
mpint	S

2. Secret Key

secret key shall be used as the key for symmetric encryption. A SHA-256 hash of the following values is the *secret key*.

mpint	S
string	shared secret
byte	'A'
string	referer

3. Initialization Vector

Depending on the encryption algorithm, if needed, the *initialization vector* can be obtained by computing a SHA-256 hash of the following values,

mpint	S
string	shared secret
byte	'B'
string	referer

Once the *trusted server* receives the response message. It computes its own values for the above and decrypts the *message body*.

5.4 Message Body

The *message body* holds the cipher text for communication between *ssh-webagent* and *trusted server*. It also includes the session identifier and the encryption algorithm for decryption purposes. The type of message body and its related contents are encrypted and stored in cipher text.

5.4.1 format

The binary format of message body is shown below,

byte	algorithm
string	identifier
string	ciphertext

algorithm used for encryption can be identified using this field. Currently supported encryption algorithms and their respective values are listed below,

AES_256_CBC	0x02
-------------	------

identifier is the session identifier.

ciphertext is the encrypted part of message body.

5.4.2 ciphertext and plaintext

The encrypted contents of *ciphertext*, namely the *plaintext*, shall be in the format specified below,

byte[4]	random
byte	type
string	identifier
... payload ...	
byte[n]	padding

random shall be a 32-bit (4 bytes) cryptographically secure random number.

type indicates the message body type and it shall be used to interpret the *payload*. The supported types are listed below,

NEW	0x02
AUTH_REQUEST	0x03
AUTH_RESPONSE	0x04

identifier is the session identifier and it shall be the same as *identifier* defined in Section 5.4.1.

payload shall be zero or more bytes of *message* content. The format of *payload* depends on message body type and they are described in detail in their respective sections.

padding shall be zero or more bytes of random padding to meet the block size requirements of encryption algorithms.

5.4.3 NEW

First *message* with a message body, in a *session*, is always of type NEW. This message is sent by *ssh-webagent* to *trusted server*. The format of *plaintext* in message body of type NEW is shown below,

byte[4]	random
byte	type
string	identifier
byte[n]	padding

It should be noted that *payload* is *empty* and, hence, is not shown in *plaintext*.

5.5 Authentication

The authentication process shall be initiated by *trusted server* after establishing a *session*. The messages used in the process are as defined in Section 5.2 and shall contain *message body* as *data* and shall use *type* PRIVATE.

5.5.1 Request

A request for “publickey” authentication is sent by the *trusted server* in the form of a *message* containing *data* of type PRIVATE and *message body* of type AUTH_REQUEST.

This request provides the secret SSH **session identifier**⁴ required to generate SSH message for signing and authentication. The format of the request *message* is shown below,

string	“SSHWebAgent”
byte	VERSION_1_1
byte	PRIVATE
string	<i>message body</i>

The format of *message body* is as follows,

byte	algorithm
string	identifier
string	<i>ciphertext</i>

And, the format of *plaintext* that is encrypted to form the *ciphertext* is,

byte[4]	random
byte	AUTH_REQUEST
string	identifier
string	SSH session identifier
byte[n]	padding

SSH **session identifier** is as defined in RFC 4253 [3], Section 7.2, “Output from Key Exchange”

5.5.2 Response

In response to the request, *ssh-webagent* shall use SSH **session identifier**, construct the SSH message and sign it with one or more private keys of the user. The resulting signatures are sent securely in a response *message* to the *trusted server* for successful authentication. The format of *plaintext* in response *message* is as follows,

byte[4]	random
byte	AUTH_RESPONSE
string	identifier
boolean	status
string	<i>signatures</i>
string	<i>options</i>
byte[n]	padding

status shall indicate whether the signing process was successful or not. It shall be used to communicate failures to *trusted server*.

signatures contain one or more signatures of the SSH message, along with the corresponding public key and comments, if any. They are formatted as follows,

uint32	<i>n</i>
string[n]	<i>item</i>

And, each *item* shall use the format shown below,

string	publickey
string	signature
string	comment

string[n] shall represent multiple strings, with the number of strings indicated by *n*. When *n* is zero, *string[n]* shall be empty and, hence, shall not be present.

options shall be used to pass information to the *trusted server* in the form of key-value pairs. It shall use the format as specified below,

uint32	<i>n</i>
byte	<i>es</i>
string[n]	<i>option</i>

And, each *option* shall hold a *key* and a *value* as shown below,

string	key
string	value

The *value* shall be encrypted using an encryption scheme *es*. The following encryption schemes shall be supported,

PKCS1_RSAES_OAEP	0x02
------------------	------

PKCS1_RSAES_OAEP encryption scheme shall use the public key of *trusted server* to encrypt the *value*.

On receiving the response message, the *trusted server* shall have all that it needs to perform “publickey” authentication in Secure Shell (SSH) protocol.

6 Performance

The authentication method ensures that the remote login to server is secure. But, for the task at hand, it is most likely a hindrance and sooner it is done, the better. The primary contributing factors to longer authentication time would be network latency to trusted server. Data encryption, signing and verification are reasonably quick on modern processors and are negligible in comparison. The latency to web agent will also be negligible since it resides on localhost.

The protocol uses HTTP requests to receive and send messages. Hence, session establishment and authentication process will each require three HTTP requests, when done synchronously. First request shall be used to get the message (request) from trusted server, second request shall be used to pass the message (request) to web agent and receive a message (response) and the final request shall be used to pass the message (response) to trusted server. With two requests to trusted server per session establishment and authentication process. A

⁴session identifier as shown in SSH message, Section 2.

total of four requests to trusted server remain the primary contributing factors to performance.

HTTP request to trusted server will be over TLS. Hence, apart from the usual TCP connection negotiation, a TLS session negotiation will also happen when a new connection is established. So, the first request will take a significantly longer time, in comparison to subsequent requests to trusted server. The total time taken to complete four requests can be significant and can be a hinderance. To achieve better performance, it is recommended that the network latency to trusted server remains below 80ms.

7 Conclusion

Secure Shell protocol has been commonly used for remote login to servers. It is the first step to managing servers remotely. As the number of servers increase, the problem of logging to multiple servers, a time consuming task, become apparent. These problems can be solved to an extent through applications which abstract out and automatically login to servers. However, these applications may require the private key of user for automatic login.

In a world with increasing use of virtualization, more and more servers (or virtual servers) are purchased from providers and managed remotely over public internet using a web browser. In the absence of a method for secure remote login to these servers, users are left to use traditional tools for login or at worst, take a security risk and, give away the private key to third-party applications.

Hence, solving the problem of secure remote login (“publickey”) over the web, ie., HTTP, will open doors for easier access to servers. And, bring back private keys to the hands of the user. When combined with a powerful server management application, this can bring servers to general public, who, without any technical knowledge, can avail internet services through their servers in a decentralized manner.

References

- [1] Ylonen, T. and C. Lonvick, Ed., “The Secure Shell (SSH) Protocol Architecture”, RFC 4251, January 2006.
- [2] Ylonen, T. and C. Lonvick, Ed., “The Secure Shell (SSH) Authentication Protocol”, RFC 4252, January 2006.
- [3] Ylonen, T. and C. Lonvick, Ed., “The Secure Shell (SSH) Transport Layer Protocol”, RFC 4253, January 2006.
- [4] OpenSSH, “PROTOCOL.agent”, ssh-agent
- [5] World Wide Web Consortium, “Cross-Origin Resource Sharing”, CORS, January 2014
- [6] Mozilla Developer Network, “Mixed Content”, 2015
- [7] Rescorla, Eric, “HTTP Over TLS”, RFC 2818, May 2000
- [8] US National Institute of Standards and Technology, “Secure Hash Standard (SHS)”, Federal Information Processing Standards Publication 180-2, August 2002.

A Trusted Servers File

The public key⁵ of trusted server and its acceptable HTTP Referer prefixes are the contents of this file. Each trusted server has an entry starting with its public key on the first line, followed by one or more acceptable prefixes of HTTP Referer values per line. The entry for trusted server ends with a line containing a single dot (.), followed by an entry for next trusted server.

A sample trusted servers file in this format has been shown below,

```
1 AAAAB3NzaC1yc2EAAAADAQABAAQBAQ
  QCrLJjgFEA7tLyydh5eS2DCglbS5/
  767i5MaCoXoxZaphI/JqTD62nYJ6P
  G0hYu8spE2kcTtNHl0mcsygFEaa8v
  lFjxYL7dW/HuOfayQ+eHZq/xPtTlu
  oSOW6yI9qKj1fnaxF9IHtdZV0kcSw
  uEmlJfKjogf6Nbyn8M+biMK6Py5K4
  sl10sN48WGYEz9Xe8CcZJdhCyw97f
  hPELlXwCqvQjGqXpekSWTe4lpiQKv
  1Zn6T7/E5VW0mvu419WkL1AU7qZ1x
  fW5bfqggXnGnm0SawRGWzFa0EtsHJ
  Wn4lc//OHiWYjOMRkLd7+VVsBEF+0
  C2IAzJ4QyQtlecLkmu5Yfq/Z
2 https://webssh.example.com/ssh/
3 https://webssh.example.com:444/ssh/
4 https://webssh.example.com:445/ssh/
5 .
6 AAAAB3NzaC1yc2EAAAADAQABAAQBAQ
  QDPYj19euMQ4Crj/OVyP69+1tELAM
  4Wt0GyG8y3ENETpa/Qv0XcJ1I2813
  lRRWt5+ame2LKQJwInK1xo3UqL+Jd
  CA10X9h1ap8w0WEm6ZHiehB0JNe7B
  gIwPY169qLpv48Xywtz28BahxZPSD
  d7k5NxiH4HIUbau3tH1vs02L0qj9p
  QOPEDh+GdmMcgEv0ZQM9B6uKJqI+
  RdiDgWHNDUW+pFwRi2xzMFQqPCqC0
  7ykKMI8G/N13Q7RQuDiRw9AhO/Brd
  F1NEa3I4fyg09nPkBP351kBrL117V
  PgoVP24VZJkZSojEKnp4KkIhGLTfg
  +5TqI6kx36blHZpx3g8txAQt
7 https://sshclient.example.com/
8 .
```

B Local IP, Port and Domain

SSH Web Agent binds to local loopback address and accepts request on localhost. The IPv4 address range assigned for local loopback is 127.0.0.0/8.⁶ Any address in this range can be used by web agent for accepting requests. However, for easier inter-operability, the IPv4 address, in this range, **127.82.11.29** and port number **8211** is suggested for use.

⁵Public key should be in a format as defined in RFC 4253 [3], Section 6.6 “Public Key Algorithms”

⁶RFC 6890, “Special-Purpose IP Address Registries”

HTTP/TLS protocol requires web agent to use a TLS certificate signed by a trusted certificate authority. TLS certificates are, typically, issued for a domain instead of an IP address.

TLS certificate and its private key will need to be distributed along with web agent. Hence, they should be considered public. And, on the same note, for security reasons, it is recommended that the entire domain is considered public and subdomains are not used for any other purpose.

The domain **localhost-ssh-webagent.in** has been assigned for this purpose and it resolves to the suggested IPv4 address, 127.82.11.29. The *whois* information for localhost-ssh-webagent.in provides the current contact to obtain TLS certificates.

C Connection Owner

A web agent listening on loopback interface can be connected to by any user. This results in a privilege escalation and unauthorized access to private key. This security issue can be mitigated by ensuring that the remote end of the local connection belongs to the owner of the web agent process itself. The premise here is that the owner of the web agent process is given access to the private key and hence can allow access to the same user.

On linux kernels, `/proc/net/tcp` provides a formatted output of active connections. In this output, the columns *local_address*, *rem_address* and *uid* are of relevance to us. The IPv4 address and port in the output are shown in hexadecimal.

The sample output below shows the web agent listening on 127.82.11.29:8211 (1), a SSH server listening on 0.0.0.0:22 (2) and a SMTP server listening on 127.0.0.1:25 (3). It should be noted that the *uid* for web agent is 1000, indicating a user, while the *uid* for others is, 0 indicating the superuser.

	local_address	rem_address	uid
1	1D0B527F:2013	00000000:0000	1000
2	00000000:0016	00000000:0000	0
3	0100007F:0019	00000000:0000	0

The sample output below shows active local connections,

local_address	rem_address	uid	
1D0B527F:2013	00000000:0000	1000	listener
1D0B527F:2013	0100007F:CE93	1000	accept
1D0B527F:2013	0100007F:CE94	0	reject
0100007F:CE93	1D0B527F:2013	1000	-
0100007F:CE94	1D0B527F:2013	0	-

Using the output above, web agent can easily compare the *uid* of connection with the process *uid*. In case of a mismatch, the connection has originated from a different user and should be rejected.